



**BELGIAN DEVELOPMENT AGENCY**

# **RESULTS REPORT 2018**



*Photo: Quy Chau district in Nghe An*

**SUPPORT FOR RESPONSIVE ACCOUNTABLE LOCAL  
GOVERNANCE PROJECT IN NGHE AN - VIE1505011**

**REPORTING PERIOD: JAN. 2018 - DEC. 2018**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ACRONYMS</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE</b> .....	<b>4</b>
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM.....	4
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION .....	5
1.3 CONCLUSIONS.....	6
<b>2 RESULTS MONITORING</b> .....	<b>10</b>
2.1 PERFORMANCE RESULT 1 .....	10
2.1.1 <i>Progress of main activities</i> .....	10
2.1.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i> .....	11
2.2 PERFORMANCE RESULT 2 .....	12
2.2.1 <i>Progress of main activities</i> .....	12
2.2.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i> .....	13
2.3 PERFORMANCE RESULT 3 .....	14
2.3.1 <i>Progress of main activities</i> .....	14
2.3.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i> .....	15
2.4 PERFORMANCE RESULT 4 .....	16
2.4.1 <i>Progress of main activities</i> .....	16
2.4.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i> .....	17
2.5 PERFORMANCE RESULT 5 .....	18
2.5.1 <i>Progress of main activities</i> .....	18
2.5.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i> .....	19
2.6 TRANSVERSAL THEMES .....	19
2.6.1 <i>Gender</i> .....	19
2.6.2 <i>Environment and social issues</i> .....	19
2.7 RISK MANAGEMENT .....	20
<b>3 LESSONS LEARNED</b> .....	<b>24</b>
<b>4 ANNEXES</b> .....	<b>25</b>
4.1 QUALITY CRITERIA.....	25
4.2 DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP .....	29
4.3 UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	29
4.4 MoRE RESULTS AT A GLANCE.....	29
4.5 BUDGET AND EXPENDITURE TO 31/12/2018.....	31

## Acronyms

DoF	Department of Finance
DoHA	Department of Home Affairs
DoIC	Department of Information and Communications
DoJ	Department of Justice
DPI	Department of Planning and Investment
ENABEL	Belgian Development Agency
IPS	Institute for Policy Studies and Media Development
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MPI	Ministry of Planning and Investment
NEX	National Execution
NOL	No Objection Letter
NTA	National Technical Assistant
RALG	Responsive Accountable Local Governance
OSS	One Stop Shop
PAR	Public Administrative Reform
PMU	Project Management Unit
PC	People's Committee
PCc	People's Council
PSC	Project Steering Committee
ToR	Terms of Reference

# 1 Intervention at a glance

## 1.1 Intervention form

<b>Intervention title</b>	Support for Responsive Accountable Local Governance in Nghe An province, Vietnam
<b>Intervention code</b>	NN 3017553
<b>NAVISION CODE</b>	VIE 1505011
<b>Location</b>	Nghe An
<b>Total budget</b>	1,150,000 EURO
<b>Partner Institution</b>	Nghe An province People's Committee
<b>Start date Specific Agreement</b>	10 <sup>th</sup> November 2016
<b>Date intervention start /Opening steering committee</b>	20 <sup>th</sup> October 2017 (1st PSC meeting)
<b>Planned end date of execution period</b>	June 30, 2019
<b>End date Specific Agreement</b>	June 30, 2019
<b>Target groups</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• People's Committees and People's Councils at the provincial, district and commune levels</li> <li>• Participating line agencies: Departments of Home Affairs, Planning and Investment, Justice, Finance, Information and Communications, etc.</li> <li>• The Vietnamese Fatherland Front members and members of mass organizations at the provincial, district and commune levels</li> <li>• The citizens of selected communes of 3 targeted districts Quy Chau (12 communes), Quy Hop (10 communes), and Cua Lo (7 wards)</li> </ul>
<b>Specific objective</b>	Improved citizen-government interaction leading to improved service delivery and increased citizen satisfaction.
<b>Results</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Improved capacity of local government at all levels to disseminate information in a citizen-friendly manner.</li> <li>2. Improved capacity of People's Councils and Mass Organizations, and specifically PIBs and CISBs to facilitate and promote improved two-way communication between citizens and government at all levels</li> </ol>

	<p>3. Improved capacity of local government at all levels to collect, analyse and utilize citizens' feedback in a transparent and deliberative fashion for more responsive and accountable local governance and improved service delivery</p> <p>4. Improved capacity for local government at all levels to identify, plan, coordinate and oversee public administrative reforms in response to engagement with citizens and socio-political organizations</p> <p>5. The exchange and effective utilization of innovations, lessons learned and good practices with regard to citizen-government interactions; is promoted at provincial and national level</p>
<b>Reporting Period</b>	January 2018 – December 2018

## 1.2 Budget execution

*All amounts in Euro*

Budget code	2nd revised Budget	3rd revised Budget	Disbursement (NEX + REGIE)				Balance at end 2018	Cumulative disbursement fraction at end 2018
			2016	2017	2018	Total		
A01	80,000	112,000	0	-	14,340	14,340	97,660	12.8%
A02	150,000	131,000	0	-	44,506	44,506	86,494	34.0%
A03	120,000	180,500	0	-	174	174	180,326	0.1%
A04	200,000	163,000	0	1,542	25,294	26,836	136,164	16.5%
A05	60,000	23,500	0	2,064	4,652	6,716	16,784	28.6%
X	0	0	0	-	-	-	0	0.0%
Z	390,000	390,000	1153	74,363	135,029	210,545	179,455	54.0%
<b>Total</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>1,153</b>	<b>77,969</b>	<b>223,995</b>	<b>303,117</b>	<b>696,883</b>	<b>30.3%</b>

## 1.3 Conclusions

### Overview

Nghe An RALG project is contributing to the improvement of local administrative service delivery and increasing two-way dialogue between citizens and government by increasing citizens' engagement on local government performance, and also increasing local government capacity to analyse and utilize citizens' feedback. The project's most recent information shows that local governments are really taking in account citizens' suggestions and aspirations that have been reflected in dialogues between local people and government at all of the 29 communes in the project area. The first dialogue between leaders of PC, Women's Union, and Department of Education and Training with representatives of school management boards, students and Parent-Teacher Associations of 12 schools in Cua Lo town has also been supported by the project, of which urgent actions were identified to deal with emerging issues of child protection, children rights and child sexual abuse prevention.



*A dialogue between leaders and students in Cua Lo town*



*Mass organizations' initiative: Propaganda paintings in a road of Cua Lo designed to raise awareness of various emerging issues*

The project had a strong year-performance designing and realizing communication measures appropriate to promote understanding and dialogue between citizens and government at all levels. Measures and innovations have been taken to customize information to be disseminated to ethnic minority communities. Moreover, priority is given to issues to be communicated that are the

most relevant to citizens and government such as land use plans, budget disclosure and citizens' rights to participate in the development of legal documents. The project and related stakeholders are now working on printing revisions of information leaflets and on web-based content available province-wide and disseminating information on relevant issues of environment and the implementation of administrative services online in the web portal in more citizen-friendly ways.

Thanks to capacity building activities of the Project, capacities of PCCs and Mass Organizations have been increased for facilitating dialogue between government and citizens. There have been 100% members of Youth Unions at district and commune levels in the project areas participating in seminars on youth work,



*A Youth Union's seminar on youth work, building strong grassroots governance, and processing citizens' feedback*

building strong grassroots governance, and processing citizens' feedback that resulted in not only their knowledge but also skills of the Youth Union members in the area of community facilitation. 100% of the members of PIBs and CISBs in the 29 targeted communes were trained on their monitoring function. Citizens are now using new online feedback mechanisms as a result of innovations that have been tested for improved citizen-government engagement, such as the development of a community oversight column on the PCc's

website, and a specialized website integrated into the provincial web portal to collect feedback on draft legal documents.

The project has also employed efforts to strengthen organizational and technical capacities of government departments to collect, analyse and utilize citizens' feedback concerning local governance and public administrative reform. As a result, while there will be about 10 government agencies among the agencies using improved mechanism for collecting citizens' feedback (website, social media, meeting/campaigns, survey, questionnaires), at least 7 government agencies will be using IT for analysing citizens' feedback from February 2019 on, after a launching event.

With regards to public administrative services, the project made a slow but steady progress towards effective planning, coordinating and monitoring public administrative reform. The project has provided related technical



*Community event integrated with communication on PAR at a project commune*

trainings to OSSs' staff and will also support the OSSs from commune to district level with necessary IT equipment for their daily operation. Communication on PAR related-topics has been integrated in community events at village and commune levels.

Local community action plans have been developed through community consultation meetings at all targeted communes. Representatives of the local people and government departments identified issues and problems facing local communities and took lead in designing follow-up plans of actions. A high priority of resources will be given to implement activities at the grassroots level in the final quarter.



<b>RALG project in Nghe An province</b>	<b>Enabel</b>
<b>Nguyen Xuan Duc</b> <b>Director of RALG PMU</b>	<b>Mrs. Krista Verstraelen</b> <b>Resident Representative ENABEL</b>

website, and a specialized website integrated into the provincial web portal to collect feedback on draft legal documents.

The project has also employed efforts to strengthen organizational and technical capacities of government departments to collect, analyse and utilize citizens' feedback concerning local governance and public administrative reform. As a result, while there will be about 10 government agencies among the agencies using improved mechanism for collecting citizens' feedback (website, social media, meeting/campaigns, survey, questionnaires), at least 7 government agencies will be using IT for analysing citizens' feedback from February 2019 on, after a launching event.



With regards to public administrative services, the project made a slow but steady progress towards effective planning, coordinating and monitoring public administrative reform. The project has provided



*Community event integrated with communication on PAR at a project commune*

related technical trainings to OSSs' staff and will also support the OSSs from commune to district level with necessary IT equipment for their daily operation. Communication on PAR related-topics has been integrated in community events at village and commune levels.

Local community action plans have been developed through community consultation meetings at all targeted communes. Representatives of the local people and government departments identified issues and problems facing local communities and took lead in designing follow-up plans of actions. A high priority of resources will be given to implement activities at the grassroots level in the final quarter.

RALG project in Nghe An province	Enabel
 <p data-bbox="341 1865 666 1937"><b>Nguyen Xuan Duc</b> Director of RALG PMU</p>	 <p data-bbox="843 1865 1324 1937"><b>Mrs. Krista Verstraelen</b> Resident Representative ENABEL</p>

## 2 Results Monitoring

### 2.1 Performance Result 1

#### 2.1.1 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress Rating <sup>1</sup>			
	A	B	C	D
<b>Result A01: Improved capacity of local government at all levels to disseminate information in a citizen-friendly manner.</b>				
<i>Activity A01.01: Support for development of the communication strategy for making information more understandable and accessible to citizens Including (i), assessing the effectiveness of existing communication methods - DoIC, and (ii), Conducting a capacity building/training needs assessment for related departments on communications of local governments' programs and policies</i>		X		
<i>Activity A01.02: Provide 02 technical trainings on: - Coordination skills and preparation of communication materials - Editing and publishing through all kinds of media (social TV radio, print,...); (Participating partners including: DoIC, DoJ, DoHA, DoF)</i>		X		
<i>Activity A01.04: Provide follow-up trainings/capacity building activities to targeted groups</i>		X		
<i>Activity A01.05: Provide district departments and commune PCs with communication facilities and equipment for more effective dissemination of information</i>		X		
<i>Activity A01.06: Support for development of the communication strategy for making information more understandable and accessible to citizens Including (i), assessing the effectiveness of existing communication methods, and (ii), Conducting a capacity building/training needs assessment for related departments on communications of local governments' programs and policies</i>		X		
<i>Activity A01.07: Work Plans of communes</i>		X		

Note 1. Progress is rated according to the following scale:

- A: The activities are ahead of schedule
- B The activities are on schedule
- C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
- D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required

### 2.1.2 Analysis of progress made

The Project gave support to developing a communication strategy for making information more understandable and accessible to citizens. The communication strategy provides a comprehensive analysis of citizens' opinions about the following contents: (i) the effectiveness of various methods of communication and co-relations between subject matter and mode of communication and engagement, (ii) the identification of priorities of issues to be communicated of the most relevance to citizens and government, (iii) which mechanism is best to allow ethnic minorities to advise local authorities, and (iv) the training needs of related departments on communications of local government's programs and policies.

In collaboration with the Project, Nghe An PC and the Institute for Policy Studies and Media Development (IPS), a forum has been organized for dialogue between government authorities, local enterprises and experts that provided an extensive overview of the current situation and challenges in the field of administrative procedures and public administrative service delivery that shape the business and investment environment in Nghe An to a high degree. The workshop has created awareness and offered comprehensive and sustainable solutions for simplification of administrative procedures that public administration reform must be driven by a two-way dialogue between the government and the citizens, including the business community, and E-government is an effective lever in fighting corruption and illegal competition advantages.

The Project also provided an instruction training to more than 100 officers from the Web Portals, OSSs and other government agencies, in which women made up 40%, that helped them understand the co-relations between subject matter and mode of communication and enabled them to select/adapt effective communication methods which are citizen-friendly.

Ethnic minority communities and citizens in the whole province have had the benefit of the communication materials that are understandable and the most relevant to local citizens and government. Prioritized issues are citizens' rights to participate in the development of legal documents (73,400 leaflets), and rights and obligations of civil status registration (73,400 leaflets), and prevention of early marriage and inbreeding (4,000 handbooks). A guideline has been developed and distributed to

1,500 local governments' spokespersons and information providers of Nghe An province.

Four disadvantaged communes in two districts of Quy Hop and Quy Chau were provided with wireless FM broadcasting, resulting in the access to radio broadcasts of more than 31,000 local people. By broadcasting in local language (Thai language in some remote villages), local radio can communicate effectively about the issues that matter most locally.



*A technical training for commune staff supported by RALG project*

Through its technical trainings, the project has built capacity of 55 staff, who were responsible for FM broadcasting, of 29 project communes. Following the trainings, the staff were able to use specialized software themselves for producing radio programs, and also to fix some technical problems when necessary.

## 2.2 Performance Result 2

### 2.2.1 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress Rating <sup>1</sup>			
	A	B	C	D
<b>Result A02: Improved capacity of People's Councils and Mass Organizations, and specifically PIBs and CISBs to facilitate and promote improved two-way communication between citizens and government at all levels</b>				
<i>Activity A02.01: Provide PCcs with trainings on citizens' engagement, community consultation and facilitation, and advocacy</i>		X		
<i>Activity A02.02: Provide mass organizations with trainings on consultation, facilitation, and analysis of citizens' feedback</i>		X		
<i>Activity A02.03: Support PCc in the development of a Community oversight column on the PCc's website</i>		X		
<i>Activity A02.04: Support to develop a handbook for PCcs' delegates/counsellors at all levels</i>		X		

Activity A02.05: Conduct a study tour to a good practice of collecting, analysing and utilizing citizens' feedback		X	
Activity A02.07: Provide PIBs and CISBs with trainings on strengthening the organization, monitoring tool and working mechanism		X	
Activity A02.08: Learn experience and good practice from other provinces in supervisory and oversight functions of PIBs and CISBs		X	
Activity A02.09: Work Plans of communes		X	

Note 1. Progress is rated according to the following scale:

- A: The activities are ahead of schedule
- B The activities are on schedule
- C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
- D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required

### 2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

The Project has contributed to enhance capacity of PCcs and Mass Organizations to facilitate two-way communication between government and citizens. There were about 1,300 members (770 women) of Youth Unions groups, Women's Unions groups, VFF, PIBs and CISBs at district and commune levels who have been provided with trainings on citizens' engagement, organising policy dialogue, supervision and social criticism, and utilizing citizens' feedback. A number of initiatives were designed, as follow-up actions after the trainings, to address existing issues facing local communities as well as to improve the quality of two-way communication such as the development of the Community



*Commune Women's Union members in Quy Hop are discussing about making a plan for supervision at villages*



*"I am actually using new skills gained from the project's trainings to organize dialogues between government leaders and people as well as communication activities in my commune", say Mrs. Vi Thi Quang, President of Women Union of Chau Cuong commune in Quy Hop. Photo: Mrs. Quang is facilitating a communication activity for women*

oversight column on the PCc's website or dialogue between government and villagers. Apart from trainings, the project also conducted study visits to good practice of collecting, analysing and utilizing citizen feedback and also supervisory and oversight functions of PIBs and CISBs for 27 members of VFFs, DPI, PIBs and CISBs. With knowledge and skills in place, PCcs and mass organizations have demonstrated their roles and functions in promoting two-way communication that resulted in more complaints and feedback received from citizen at project communes.

Improving feedback mechanisms for citizens is at heart of the project works and indeed, all of activities under this result. Thus, the project developed a Community Oversight Column on the PCc's website, which involves receiving citizens' feedback and providing information on how their feedback is being responded to.



Two ways citizens can provide comments on the Community Oversight Column on the PCc's website: <http://dbndnghean.vn>

With the project's support for the development of a specialized website integrated into the provincial Web Portal - <http://duthaovanban.nghean.gov.vn>, citizens and enterprises in Nghe An now can comment on draft legal documents before promulgation. This promotes the mastery of citizens and mobilizes knowledge of citizens in order to create consensus and to express people's aspirations. This kind of activity is also expected to raise awareness of the people and create sense of responsibility of the PC, PCc at all levels, organizations and individuals for the promulgation of legal documents in Nghe An province via the Internet.

## 2.3 Performance Result 3

### 2.3.1 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress Rating <sup>1</sup>			
	A	B	C	D
<b>Result A03: Improved capacity of local governments at all levels to collect, analyse and utilize citizens' feedback in a transparent and deliberative</b>				

<b>fashion for more responsive and accountable local governance and improved service delivery</b>				
<i>Activity A03.02: Improve capacity of providing information and public online services of the provincial electronic portal and OSSs</i>		X		
<i>Activity A03.03: Provide technical assistance for more effective collection and utilization of citizens' feedback, and the institutionalization of beneficial administrative reform in a citizens-participatory process.</i>		X		
<i>Activity A03.04: Support for development of an online system for assessing the satisfaction of citizens and organizations on public administrative services (PC, DPI, provincial Web Portal, DoHA)</i>		X		
<i>Activity A03.07: Work Plans of communes</i>		X		

Note 1. Progress is rated according to the following scale:

- A: The activities are ahead of schedule
- B The activities are on schedule
- C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
- D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required

### 2.3.2 Analysis of progress made

In order to help the OSSs overcome existing difficulties as well as to improve capacities of providing information and public online services, the Project is planning to supply IT equipment to OSSs of communes and those at district level of 3 targeted districts. Specifically, the supply of IT equipment will contribute to an efficient and easy-to-access portal to administrative services, enhance the implementation of more online public services at commune and district levels, save time and expenditures of public administrative procedures. The project has provided trainings for more than 200 leaders, receptionists, and inspectorate of government agencies on receiving, processing and responding to citizens' denouncement, complaints and inquiries.

Under this Result, the project will also be focusing on building an online system collecting citizens' and organizations' feedback on their satisfaction with public service delivery of administrative agencies. IT application in collection of feedback will enhance automation, save time and costs and reduce the influence of subjective factors in collecting feedback from citizens on the quality of public administrative services. In return, administrative agencies, thanks to the collection of feedback, will have an overall understanding about citizens' and organizations' satisfaction with its public service delivery, through which they can find solutions to improve service



delivery quality and enhance officials' responsibility and behaviour towards citizens and organizations.

Taking follow-up action after trainings on community facilitation and supervision and social criticism, the project worked with mass organizations to organize dialogues at all of pilot communes. It is impressive that the communes are now receiving more feedbacks from citizens and that the dialogues are not formalistic any more.



*A dialogue between government leaders and local people is conducted VFF at a commune by VFF*

## 2.4 Performance Result 4

### 2.4.1 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress Rating <sup>1</sup>			
	A	B	C	D
<b>Result A04: Improved capacity for local government at all levels to identify, plan, coordinate and oversee public administrative reforms in response to engagement with citizens and socio-political organizations</b>				
<i>Activity A04.01: Support the province to carry out a citizen report card survey on areas of business registration, certificates of land use rights, issuing different kinds of permits</i>		X		
<i>Activity A04.03: Build capacity of public administration and service delivery from provincial down to commune level</i>		X		
<i>Activity A04.04: Develop, validate/refine tools and processes for citizen-sensitive, participatory C-SEDP implementation including budgeting, tendering and procurement processes and, monitoring and oversight processes arrangement</i>		X		
<i>Activity A04.05: Support the provincial Web Portal in the development of a website for collecting citizens' comments on draft legal documents that is integrated in the Web Portal</i>		X		
<i>Activity A04.06: Support to clarify and simplify government departments' roles and responsibilities, and administrative procedures</i>		X		
<i>Activity A04.07: Provide departments and districts with trainings on C-SEDP</i>		X		

Activity A04.09: Learning and sharing event for the exchange of good practice with other projects/provinces		X	
Activity A04.11: Develop communication materials on PAR		X	
Activity A04.12: Work Plans of communes		X	

Note 1. Progress is rated according to the following scale:

- A: The activities are ahead of schedule
- B The activities are on schedule
- C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
- D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required

### 2.4.2 Analysis of progress made

There were 180 officials of provincial departments, agencies, districts, towns and investors in Nghe An province, in which there were 65 female persons, trained on launching the Information System of Public Investment, the Information System of monitoring and evaluation of investment programs and projects using state capital. Cadres, civil servants and investors can now use the system for making progress reports of public investment projects, developing public investment plans and M&E reports of investment, increasing the efficiency of using public investment capital. The training has also contributed to the promotion of IT applications in management of public investment.

In collaboration with the Planning and Management Department of MPI, the Project also supported Nghe An DPI in providing a training on the Planning Law and its guiding documents to 68 female and 122 male officials from government departments at province and districts levels. The training is expected to enhance capacity of local governments in identifying and coordinating public



*Training on checking and evaluating administrative procedures and responsibilities of organizations and individuals in settling administrative procedures.*

administrative reforms, which is linked with the result 4 of the project

Two study-tour visits have been conducted for 43 provincial partners to Northern provinces for learning their experience in the fields of public administrative reform and One Stop Shop (OSS) mechanism and interconnected OSS mechanism. Some good practices that are of interest for Nghe An are:

- Collection of citizens' and organizations' feedback on their satisfaction with public service delivery by administrative agencies via an online system
- Handbook on evaluating impacts of administrative procedure regulations
- Establishment of a working group for reviewing and checking administrative procedures, making proposals for simplification of administrative procedures

## 2.5 Performance Result 5

### 2.5.1 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress Rating <sup>1</sup>			
	A	B	C	D
<b>Result A05: The exchange and effective utilization of innovations, lessons learned and good practices with regard to citizen-government interactions; is promoted at provincial and national levels</b>				
<i>Activity A05.01: Document good practices and success models for the effective achievement of planned outcomes</i>		X		
<i>Activity A05.02: Exchange experience and lessons learned and seek for cooperation opportunities with relevant partners (national universities and institutions, etc) on the promotion of citizen-government interaction</i>		X		
<i>Activity A05.05: Conduct review meetings on project progression and performance</i>		X		

Note 1. Progress is rated according to the following scale:

- A: The activities are ahead of schedule
- B The activities are on schedule
- C The activities are delayed, corrective measures are required.
- D The activities are seriously delayed (more than 6 months). Substantial corrective measures are required

## 2.5.2 Analysis of progress made

The project facilitated the exchange and effective utilization of innovations, lessons learned and good practices with not only counterparts from Ha Tinh and Kon Tum provinces, but also organizations/institutions and universities such as the National Women's Academy, National Women's Union, the



*The 2<sup>nd</sup> PSC meeting of RALG projects in Nghe An and Ha Tinh in provinces in October 2018*

Institute of Policy Study and Communication Development who are interested in the promotion of citizen-government interaction. The 2<sup>nd</sup> PSC meeting of RALG projects in Nghe An and Ha Tinh provinces was conducted for the projects' reflections and sharing experience between the projects. The project is now focussing on documentation of its good practice and lessons learned so that project results and impacts can be documented and shared with concerning stakeholders via networks and media.

## 2.6 Transversal Themes

### 2.6.1 Gender

The project increased its effectiveness in putting women's rights and gender equality at the centre of all campaigns and dialogues. Gender-related themes were integrated into communication/campaign events at communities. By supporting citizen engagement in SEDP and public service delivery, the project contributed to promote mechanisms and chances for women to voice their concerns on these topics in particular and overall local government performance in general.

### 2.6.2 Environment and social issues

Environmental perspectives have been integrated into communication activities at villages. Communication materials on climate change, water and management for sustainable development were developed and made available at project communes

## 2.7 Risk management

Identification of risk or issue			Analysis of risk or issue			Deal with risk or issue			Follow-up of risk or issue	
Risk description	Period of identification	Category	Likelihood	Potential impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
More responsive, transparent local government does not lead to accelerated social and economic development	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	Low	Low Risk	More responsive and transparent governance requires political commitment and a willingness to be creative and innovative. All indications suggest there are high levels of political commitment at the provincial and district levels to planned results and a willingness to exercise political authority to that end	PSC, PMU	(project life)	there is clear commitment as expressed in commune and district action plans	In progress
						Inter-provincial exchanges of lessons learned and good practices can create opportunities for the sharing and mainstreaming of innovations in a manner which expands stakeholders' sense of what is possible	PSC, PMU	(project life)	study tours have been organized; more structural exchanges such as systemic information exchange online is in discussion	
Possible resistance (local government stakeholders) to change or place self-imposed limits to the scope for innovation and creativity for PAR and accountable, transparent local governance	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	High	Medium Risk	Use of comparative and evidenced-based methods that would help project holders to take management decisions conducive to a more enabling environment for the achievement of planned results	PMU	(project life)	commune and district action plans in place	In progress
						Good practices and lessons learned will be transferred, where possible and applicable across provinces	PMU	(project life)	PORIS legacy is in the process of being applied province wide	

Much focus on performance indicators (PAPI, PAR & PCI) rather on adoption of new innovative business practices and new forms of social partnership	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	High		Enhance communication capacity to PMU to help implementing agencies understand better the project	PMU	(project life)	provical, district commune working groups	In progress
					Medium Risk	The political leadership within the province have a sophisticated and enlightened appreciation of the objectives of the project and the challenges to be addressed during project implementation	PSC, PMU	(project life)	Addressed	
					Medium Risk	Clear, consistent and appropriate vision and leadership will be provided by the Steering Committee to ensure implementing partners confront the fundamental challenges	PSC, PMU	(project life)	Addressed	
					Medium Risk	Add the indicator on the citizen engagement and interaction between the citizen and government	PMU	1/10/2017	addressed	
Lack of project management capacities risk (of implementing partners)	TFF preparation (2016)	DEV	Low	Low	Low Risk	The the Provincial Project Working Group will be supported (by NTA and ITA) to create robust monitoring arrangements for project planning, coordination and oversight	PMU	to be defined	addressed	Terminated
					Low Risk	Have ITA identify possible knowledge, experience and exposure gaps and suggest capacity building activities	PMU	to be defined	addressed	
Service providers cannot be mobilized to provide the required specialized technical assistance (TA) to implementing partners in a timely fashion	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	Low	Low Risk	For TA needs shared by multiple provinces the ITA will identify suitable national-level service providers capable of meeting the needs of multiple provinces in a cost-efficient and technically robust manner	BTC	to be defined	unaddressed yet	In progress

The PMU is unable to manage project finances in accordance with minimum standards for national execution	TFF preparation (2016)	DEV	Low	Low	Low Risk	For TA needs which can be met from within the province, the PMU will support procurement processes and communicate with other provinces where service providers are providing exemplary services	PMU	to be defined	unaddressed yet	Terminated
						Strengthen consultants' supervision capacity to PMU	PMU	(project life)	unaddressed yet	
						Personnel who worked in the PORIS PMU will be assigned to work in the PMU for this project	PMU	to be defined	Addressed; internal procurement proceedings need to be surveilled closely as to avoid implementation delays	
						Possible for short term backstopping to be provided by the BTC representation in Hanoi	PMU	to be defined	Addressed	
Citizens may be sceptical or non-responsive to efforts made by local government stakeholders to improve two-way communication	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	Low	Low Risk	Multiple stakeholders will be supported to engage with citizen at all levels. The technical assistance provided is likely to result in overall increase in citizen-government dialogue	PMU	to be defined	Addressed; story telling	Terminated
						Promote participatory SED planning				

						<p>Emphasis will be placed in creating synergies and complementarity between the support provided to state and non-state stakeholders. This complementarity can be expected to create an enabling environment for the achievement of planned results</p> <p>Promote direct dialogues between government agencies and citizen</p>				
Public servants and other implementing partners demonstrate resistance to the adoption of attitudinal changes which may be required for the achievement of planned results	TFF preparation (2016)	OPS	Low	Low	Low Risk	Project holders are well aware of the attitudinal change that this project is designed to bring about and are in favour of changes which will enable project objectives to be achieved. Project holders can be expected to create incentives for stakeholders to embrace innovation and attitudinal and behavioural adaptation within the public service.	PSC, PMU	to be defined	addressed, story telling and communication about project successes	In progress
The planned scope and reach of the project in terms of number of districts, communes and volume of planned activities and results exceeds capacities to deliver	TFF preparation (2016)	JUR	Low	Medium	Low Risk	Scope of the work for the first year will be critically assessed from the perspective of implementation capacity. Project implementation will be monitored closely.	PMU	31/12/2017	the bottleneck actually is slow internal financial and administrative procedures at province level; at national level a new decree should solve quite some problems	In progress



### 3 Lessons Learned

<b>Lessons learned</b>	<b>Target audience</b>
We realise that we have not always done enough to put people first, and the lessons that we have learned from this will be reflected in our activities in the last coming months	NTA, PMU
As usual, administrative procedures take time and that the PMU must find the best way to complete the settlement of activities before 31 March 2019.	PMU

## 4 Annexes

### 4.1 Quality criteria

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D'= C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment RELEVANCE: total score	A	B	C	D
X				
<b>1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?</b>				
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.		
<b>1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?</b>				
<input type="checkbox"/>	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).		
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.		
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.		

**2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way**

*In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', no 'C' or 'D' = B; at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D*

Assessment EFFICIENCY : total score	A	B	C	D
		X		

**2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?**

<b>A</b>	All inputs are available on time and within budget.
<input type="checkbox"/> <b>B</b>	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.
<b>C</b>	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.
<b>D</b>	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.

**2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?**

<b>A</b>	Activities implemented on schedule
<input type="checkbox"/> <b>B</b>	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs
<b>C</b>	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.
<b>D</b>	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.

**2.3 How well are outputs achieved?**

<b>A</b>	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
<input type="checkbox"/> <b>B</b>	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
<b>C</b>	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
<b>D</b>	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

**3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N**

*In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D*

<b>Assessment EFFECTIVENESS : total score</b>	<b>A</b>	<b>B</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>D</b>
		X		

**3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>A</b>	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>B</b>	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>C</b>	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>D</b>	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.

**3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<b>A</b>	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>B</b>	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>C</b>	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.
<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>D</b>	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.

**4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).**

*In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D*

Assessment POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY : total score		A	B	C	D
			X		
<b>4.1 Financial/economic viability?</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.			
<b>4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.			
<b>4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.			
<input type="checkbox"/>	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.			
<b>4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?</b>					
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).			

<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>B</b>	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.
	<b>C</b>	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.
	<b>D</b>	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.

## 4.2 Decisions taken by the steering committee and follow-up



Decisions taken  
by the steering

## 4.3 Updated Logical framework



ED Revised  
Logframe - VIE

## 4.4 MoRe Results at a glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	Updated indicators approved in September 2018.
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	Baseline Report approved in October 2017.
Planning MTR (registration of report)	N/A
Planning ETR (registration of report)	April 2019

Backstopping missions since 01/01/2018	Backstopping conducted July 2018, September 2018, October 2018, November 2018 and January 2019.
---	--

## 4.5 Budget and expenditure to 31/12/2018

Code	Description	Budget (EUR)		Disbursement (EUR)										Balance (EUR)	
				2016		2017		2018		Total to end 2018		Fract. of budget		BEL	VN
		BEL	VN (MIL)	BEL	VN (MIL)	BEL	VN (MIL)	BEL	VN (MIL)	BEL	VN (MIL)	BEL	VN (MIL)		
A01	Improved capacity of LG to disseminate information	112,000	2,912	-	-	-	-	14,340	380	14,340	380	13%		97,660	2,532
A02	Improved capacity of PPC mass organisations to facilitate 2-way communication	131,000	3,406	-	-	-	-	44,506	1,158	44,506	1,158	34%		86,494	2,248
A03	Improved capacity of LG to collect, analyse and utilize citizen feed back	180,500	4,693	-	-	-	-	174	5	174	5	0%		180,326	4,689
A04	Improved capacity for LG to plan coordinated PAR reforms	163,000	4,238	-	-	1,542	41	25,294	668	26,836	709	16%		136,164	3,529
A0501	Workshops, capitalization exercises	22,500	585	-	-	2,064	55	4,652	122	6,716	177	30%		15,784	408
A0502	Studies and consultancies through framework contracts	1,000	26	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0%		1,000	26
X0101	Contingencies COGEST	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-			-	-



X0102	Contingencies REGIE	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-			-	-
Z0101	International Technical Assistance - Technical advisor	180,000	4,680	1,147	30	54,255	1,411	47,005	1,222	102,406	2,663	57%		77,594	2,017
Z0102	National Technical Assistant	50,852	1,322	7	0	10,948	285	20,423	531	31,377	816	62%		19,475	506
Z0103	Translator cum Administrative Assistant	16,800	437	-	-	2,043	55	8,206	218	10,249	273	61%		6,551	164
Z0104	Driver	7,350	191	-	-	-	-	104	3	104	3	1%		7,246	188
Z0105	Financial Officer	19,200	499	-	-	2,180	58	8,701	230	10,881	288	57%		8,319	212
Z0201	IT equipment	8,000	208	-	-	281	8	5,688	150	5,969	157	75%		2,031	51
Z0202	Vehicle	38,350	997	-	-	-	-	37,379	1,008	37,379	1,008	97%		971	-10
Z0301	operational costs technical assistance modalities	17,948	467	-	-	2,318	60	115	3	2,433	63	14%		15,515	403
Z0302	Other Operating Expenditures	18,500	481	-	-	816	22	2,814	63	3,630	85	20%		14,870	396
Z0401	Backstopping	9,000	234	-	-	1,522	40	28	1	1,550	40	17%		7,450	194
Z0402	Evaluation (baseline, evaluation,...)	15,000	390	-	-	-	-	4,566	119	4,566	119	30%		10,434	271

Z0403	Auditing	9,000	234	-	-	-	-			-	-	0%		9,000	234
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>1,000,000</b>	<b>26,000</b>	<b>1,153</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>77,969</b>	<b>2,034</b>	<b>223,995</b>	<b>5,877</b>	<b>303,117</b>	<b>7,941</b>	<b>30%</b>		<b>696,883</b>	<b>18,059</b>