



BTC



RESULTS REPORT 2014

**TECHNICAL SUPPORT UNIT FOR WATER
MANAGEMENT AND URBAN
DEVELOPMENT IN RELATION TO
CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE PROVINCES
OF HA TINH, NINH THUAN AND BINH
THUAN**

ACRONYMS	4
1 INTERVENTION AT A GLANCE (MAX. 2 PAGES)	6
1.1 INTERVENTION FORM	6
1.2 BUDGET EXECUTION	6
1.3 SELF-ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE	7
1.3.1 <i>Relevance</i>	7
1.3.2 <i>Effectiveness</i>	7
1.3.3 <i>Efficiency</i>	7
1.3.4 <i>Potential sustainability</i>	7
1.4 CONCLUSIONS	7
2 RESULTS MONITORING.....	9
2.1 EVOLUTION OF THE CONTEXT	9
2.1.1 <i>General context</i>	9
2.1.2 <i>Institutional context</i>	9
2.1.3 <i>Management context: execution modalities</i>	9
2.1.4 <i>Harmo context</i>	9
2.2 PERFORMANCE OUTCOME.....	9
2.2.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	10
2.2.2 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	11
2.2.3 <i>Potential Impact</i>	12
2.3 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 1	13
2.3.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	13
2.3.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	13
2.3.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	13
2.4 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 2.....	15
2.4.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	15
2.4.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	15
2.4.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	15
2.5 PERFORMANCE OUTPUT 3.....	16
2.5.1 <i>Progress of indicators</i>	16
2.5.2 <i>Progress of main activities</i>	16
2.5.3 <i>Analysis of progress made</i>	16
2.6 TRANSVERSAL THEMES.....	19
2.6.1 <i>Gender</i>	19
2.6.2 <i>Environment</i>	19
2.6.3 <i>Other</i>	19
2.7 RISK MANAGEMENT	20
3 STEERING AND LEARNING	22
3.1 STRATEGIC RE-ORIENTATIONS.....	22
3.2 RECOMMENDATIONS.....	22
3.3 LESSONS LEARNED	22
4 ANNEXES.....	23

4.1	QUALITY CRITERIA	23
4.2	DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE STEERING COMMITTEE AND FOLLOW-UP	26
4.3	UPDATED LOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	29
4.4	MORE RESULTS AT A GLANCE	29
4.5	“BUDGET VERSUS CURRENT (Y – M)” REPORT.....	29
4.6	COMMUNICATION RESOURCES	32

Acronyms

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AFD	Agence Française de Développement
BTC	Belgian Technical Co-operation
CC	Climate Change
DSENRE	Department of Science, Education, Natural Resources and Environment - MPI
GESF	Green Economy Strategy Facility
IWRM	Integrated Water Resource Management
JICA	Japanese International Cooperation Agency
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoC	Ministry of Construction
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoHA	Ministry of Home Affairs
MoNRE	Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment
MPI	Ministry of Planning and Investment
MTR	Midterm Review
NTP-RCC	National Target Programme for Response to Climate Change
ODA	Official Development Aid
PCU	Project Coordination Unit
POM	Project Operation Manual
PPC	Provincial People's Committee
SAV	State audit of Vietnam
SC	Steering Committee

SPRCC	Support Programme to Respond to Climate Change
TFF	Technical and Financial File
ToR	Terms of Reference
TSU	Technical Support Unit
UN REDD	UN Collaborative Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in Developing Countries
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	UN Environment Programme
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
VUDA	Vietnam Urban Development Agency - MoC
VUF	Vietnam Urban Forum
WB	World Bank

1 Intervention at a glance (max. 2 pages)

1.1 Intervention form

Intervention title	Technical Support Unit for water management and urban development in relation to Climate change in the Provinces of Ha Tinh, Ninh Thuan and Binh Thuan
Intervention code	NN 3012430
Location	Hanoi
Total budget	4,400,000 EURO
Partner Institution	Ministry of Planning and Investment
Start date Specific Agreement	June 20, 2013
Date intervention start /Opening steering committee	October 16, 2013 (1st SC meeting)
Planned end date of execution period	June 20, 2019
End date Specific Agreement	June 20, 2020
Target groups	
Impact	To contribute to the sustainable development of Vietnam, by enhancing its resilience to Climate Change
Outcome	To strengthen the capacities in climate change management in relation to Integrated Water Resource Management and Urban Development.
Outputs	Expertise is provided to the provinces of Ha Tinh, Ninh Thuan and Binh Thuan
	Coordination at central and provincial level is strengthened
	Knowledge management of the experiences is assured
Year covered by the report	2014

1.2 Budget execution

	Budget	Expenditure		Balance	Disbursement rate at the end of year 2014
		Previous years (2013)	Year covered by report (2014)		
Total	4,000,000	94,594	378,802	3,526,604	9.47 %
A01	2,910,000	94,594	250,253	2,565,153	8.60 %
A02	147,000		5,723	141,277	3.89 %
A03	295,000		47,514	247,486	16.11%
A04	100,000		87	99,913	0.09 %
X	114,900		0	114,900	0 %
Z	433,100	75,225	357,875	17,375	17.37%

1.3 Self-assessment performance

1.3.1 Relevance

	Performance
Relevance	

The project is in conformity with priorities of Vietnamese government, contributes to Vietnam's national strategy and action plans in Sustainable development, Climate change adaptation and impact mitigation.

1.3.2 Effectiveness

	Performance
Effectiveness	

The project has just passed 15 months of study phase with no specific result, therefore the effectiveness can not be assessed.

1.3.3 Efficiency

	Performance
Efficiency	

The project has just passed 15 months of study phase with no specific result, therefore efficiency can not be assessed.

1.3.4 Potential sustainability

	Performance
Potential sustainability	

The project has just passed 15 months of study phase with no specific result, therefore efficiency can not be assessed.



If the project achieved its objectives and outputs specified in TFF, necessary scientific foundation would be established for the provinces to develop their urban planning, integrated water resource management in relation to Climate change towards sustainable development and capacity enhancement benefited by managing and expertise officers in related fields.

1.4 Conclusions

- **Technical & Financial file (TFF):** basically, project's logical frame (log frame) is suitable. However, activities should be reviewed every year to revise or amend

issues relating to human resources and budget allocation in order to assure achieving expected outcome.

- **Institution:** There needs to be a clear system of duties and communication mechanism to coordinate and increase effectiveness of collaboration between TSU, BTC and PCU and through the POM, TSU's technical support to provincial projects. Therefore, priorities should be paid for an early preparation and approval of this POM in the first 6 months of 2015.
- **Disbursement:** in 2014, 57% of disbursement plan was reached. Low disbursement rate is due to:
 - o Action and procurement plans were approved in June 2014;
 - o Specific activities at provincial level had not been implemented therefore, it was not necessary to recruit technical officers, experts/consultants this year;
 - o Estimates for operation, per diem ...were higher than practical expenditure because this is the 1st year, there were not many activities and lack of conditions to assess regular expenditure when planning (electric, water, IT, stationery, cars ...)
- **Related parties should improve:**
 - o Consensus on objective and coordination/supporting relations within the project/program;
 - o Exchange information timely between related parties (BTC, TSU and PCUs) through periodic reports, feedback on managerial and coordinative information between agencies;
 - o Assurance on progress of approving action/financial/procurement plans.

National execution official	BTC execution official
 <p data-bbox="451 1435 760 1503">Mr. Nguyen Tuan Anh Deputy Director PMU TSU</p>	 <p data-bbox="879 1435 1350 1503">Mr. Alain Devaux Resident Representative BTC VIETNAM</p>

2 Results Monitoring

2.1 Evolution of the context

2.1.1 General context

In 2014, there are many international and national major events about climate change (COP-20 with 196 countries and territories who ratified UN's Frame protocol on Climate change and 10th meetings of Kyoto convention's member - Lima Climate change conference Dec-2014; PMR meeting in Chile Sept-2014; Vietnam announced its report of Mekong delta development against climate change, etc.) which means climate change continues to be an issues considered by international community, governments and Vietnam. Consensus and resources are always in place to deal with challenges in adapting to climate change and mitigating its impacts.

2.1.2 Institutional context

After 15 months of implementation, the project hasn't got its POM which constitute a legal and institutional framework for operation, procedures and coordination mechanism within the program.

2.1.3 Management context: execution modalities

The program includes 4 component projects. Among those, TSU plays an coordinating roles and provides technical support to 3 provincial projects. However, program's structure does not assure a physical connection between components. This in turns leads to a fact that sometimes provincial projects consider cooperation less than their own activities. Besides, unequal awareness and capacity of provincial officers also infects implementation progress.

2.1.4 Harmo context

The project is regulated by 2 systems/legal frames of BTC and Vietnamese government. Although BTC has done its best to simplify procedures, this still increase administrative responsibility of management board with 2 systems and templates of accounting report. Although expenditure in CM & PM budget lines are regulated by Vietnamese procurement law and partly by BTC's procurement thresholds, dual process of approval prolongs bidding period and activities implementation. In other words, this does not fully reflect the spirit of Paris Declaration and Hanoi declaration on harmonization of ODA process. Ownership of Vietnam has not been fully reflected.

2.2 Performance outcome



2.2.1 Progress of indicators

The TFF did not provide M&E indicators for the project. Workshop was organized to build M&E indicators for TSU and provincial projects in 2014. TSU's SC has approved its indicators at the meeting in December 2014. In 2015 the baseline report will quantize the indicators which can be published only by the end of 2015.

Outcome: <i>Timely and appropriately expertise is provided in a more cost-efficient way to provincial projects</i>					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Outcome 1: <i>Timely and appropriately expertise is provided in a more cost-efficient way to provincial projects</i>					
Indicator 1-1: <i>Number of Terms of Reference (TOR) approved on time by Project Coordination Units (PCU) and related agencies according to project plans</i>					
Indicator 1-2: <i>Rate of qualified trainees after assessment</i>					
Indicator 1-3: <i>100% comments from PCUs in training reports are discussed and handled (if necessary and agreed)</i>					
Indicator 1-4: <i>Rate of trainees/seminar participants who understand the relations between their jobs and Climate change</i>					
Indicator 1-5: <i>Unity between TSU's and PCUs' action plans</i>					
Indicator 1-6: <i>Rate of agencies/PCUs who receive and satisfy with services/reports provided by TSU</i>					
Outcome 2 : <i>Co-ordination between central and provincial level is strengthened</i>					
Indicator 2-1: <i>Functional level of the TSU</i>					
Indicator 2-2: <i>Rate of timely feedback between PCUs and TSU (pursuant to agreement)</i>					
Indicator 2-3: <i>Rate of development partners, institutions (organizations/individual) who participate in information exchange and sharing activities at central level</i>					
Indicator 2-4: <i>Rate of development partners, institutions (organizations/individual) who participate activities at provincial level</i>					
Indicator 2-5: <i>Number of connections between TSU and related stakeholders (international and national) at central level field of Climate change, contributing to CC related activities at provincial level</i>					
Indicator 2-6: <i>Number of seminars organized to promote collaboration between CC related activities</i>					
Outcome 3: <i>Assuring management of practical</i>					

knowledge and experience from provincial projects					
Indicator 3-1: Rate of development partners, institutions (organizations/individual) who participate in information exchange and sharing activities at central level					
Indicator 3-2: Rate of development partners, institutions (organizations/individual) who participate activities at provincial level					
Indicator 3-3: Participants to CC related forums highly appreciate the active participation and contribution of TSU and other members of the program in these forums					
Indicator 3-4: Number of concept notes in Climate change base on program experience, assuring project's quality					
Indicator 3-5: Number of experience/activities, seminar/exchange between central and provincial levels					
Indicator 3-6: 100% of CC, IWRM and Urban development related ideas which are submitted to relevant ministries, are suitable to project's objectives					
Indicator 3-7: Contacts between PCUs/provinces are established					
Indicator 3-8: Rate of participants in information sharing/exchange satisfied with knowledge earned in these events					

2.2.2 Analysis of progress made

This analysis bases on M&E indicators approved by the SC. Specified are only indicators relating to implemented activities or can be assessed in 2014.

Output 1: Timely and appropriately expertise is provided in a more cost-efficient way to provincial projects

Indicator 1-1: In 2014, three provinces have approved 9 TORs in hydraulic/hydrology, CC downscaling and TICA prepared by TSU. However, approval on these TORs was delayed by at least 6 months. Concern is that these studies shall not be implemented simultaneously at the provinces as designed in TFF. Although this does not affect provincial projects' outputs, effectiveness and efficiency of TSU's consulting support to PCUs in this studies will be influenced.

- **Indicator 1-2:** 100% participants in the TSU organized project management training and 2 M&E training courses were certified. This will promote capacity and project managing and implementing quality.

- **Indicator 1-5:** Action plans between TSU and PCUs are unified. However, synchronization must be assured to solve issues specified in indicator 1-1.

Outcome 2: Coordination at central and provincial level is strengthened

- **Indicator 2-2:** PCU provides timely feedback to TSU regarding activities' details and cooperation mechanism. Therefore, TSU's activities can meet schedules. PCUs' feedbacks have high quality especially relating to technical fields and methods of implementation which can lead to a good progress and quality.

- **Indicator 2-5:** Cooperation between TSU and international partners such as WB, ADB, GIS was established. Through these connections, TSU and PCUs may have chances to approach and update CC and Green growth related information. If these

connection could be institutionalized via official cooperation agreements for example consultant/experts exchange, common knowledge and experiences would be promoted through and projects' effectiveness and productivity will be increased too.

2.2.3 Potential Impact

TSU's timely and quality technical support can assure the scientific foundation for developing, revising urban development planning, IWRM in relations to CC towards sustainable development and promoting capacity of related officers at management and technical levels in the provinces. Institutional and practical lessons and experiences can also be learned while contributing to related national policies.

Basically, project's log frame is still valid for implementing, monitoring and evaluating itself.

2.3 Performance output 1



2.3.1 Progress of indicators

Output 1: Technical support to provincial and central levels					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Number of recruited technical assistances, experts and consultants.	0	13			
Number of prepared TORs		15			
Number of prepared documents on project management, monitoring and evaluation.		1			

2.3.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
1. Recruitment of TSU's officers and consultants		x		
2. Writing TORs for TICA, hydraulic/hydrology and climate change studies and for consultants		x		
3. Writing POM				x
4. Setting M&E indicators		x		

2.3.3 Analysis of progress made

- Recruitment of TSU's officers and consultants

In 2014, TSU and BTC have recruited:

- + 04 national technical assistances
- + Two coordinators, one national and one international, working at PMU offices are important to project operation.
- + 04 international technical advisors on: hydraulic/hydrology, climate change, capacity development and M&E;
- + 03 national technical advisors on hydraulic and climate change.

Recruitment of 4 international experts/consultants was delayed in 2014 due to following objective reasons:

- + Hydraulic/hydrological, climate change and TICA studies at provincial level did not work as schedule (will start in 2015 instead of 2014 as planned)
- + Recruiting full-time consultant with high quality was impossible. In order to have high quality consultant, working model has been changed from full-time to part-time.

These issues do not affect project's result. TSU has revised its plan and recruitment methods to ensure providing support timely and effectively to provincial projects.

- Writing TORs for TICA, hydraulic/hydrology and climate change studies at three provinces:

In 2014, TSU has finished 15 TORs to recruit experts/consultants and providing technical support to provincial projects. These TORs was approved by BTC, TSU and PCUs and ready for bidding. Approving TORs was later than schedule.

- Writing POM:

BTC is responsible for this job. However, draft POM submitted by Vietnamese consultant did not meet requirement. BTC overcame this issue by recruiting international consultant on administrative management to finalising it. It is foreseen that by the end of Q1. 2015, this job will be finished. This partly affects the progress and cooperation between components of the program but in short time it does not affect project's results.

- Setting M&E indicators:

The main role of TSU is providing technical support to provincial projects. Therefore, its data baseline and M&E indicators are based on provincial ones which will be developed in 2015.

This does not seriously affect project's results because program's results depend of progress and quality of activities at provincial level.

2.4 Performance output 2

2.4.1 Progress of indicators

Output 2: TSU's working visits in three provinces.					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Number of TSU's working visits in three provinces		9			

2.4.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
Organize working visits of TSU's officers, advisors and consultants to technically support PCUs		x		

2.4.3 Analysis of progress made

In 2014, TSU organized 9 working visits of international and national experts/consultants to technically support the provinces in writing TORs of hydraulic/hydrology, CC and TICA studies in order to support them in selecting contractors for this job. Studies' results will be scientific foundation for urban development planning, integrated water resource management in relations to climate change towards sustainable development and higher capacity of managerial and technical staffs in related fields at provincial level.

Through workshops on writing TORS, provincial technical staffs' capacity were also enhanced.

While working in the provinces, international advisors also trained technical staff from related agencies of 3 provinces on issues relating to 2 studies, promoted their capacity and support these agencies in controlling studies results. This training is expected to assure contribution of studies into revision of planning, strategies, action plans of provinces in terms of IWRM, urban and drainage planning of targeted urban areas.

2.5 Performance output 3

2.5.1 Progress of indicators

Output 3: Situation analysis of national and provincial actors & development of a strategy					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Number of studies and analyses conducted		0			

2.5.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
1. Study and analyse			x	

2.5.3 Analysis of progress made

In 2014, TSU organized meetings between TSU and Water resource management agency (MoNRE) and Urban development agency (MoC); 02 working visits in Ha Tinh and Ninh Thuan (September and October) to discuss with PCUs and related agencies on status of implementing strategies/action plans relating to climate change, green growth and demands for institutional support. Through these meetings, initial proposals were submitted such as:

- Review urban planning based on results of climate scenarios hydro modelling studies;
- Developing regulations on urban, surface water and drainage management;
- Review or drawing urban risk maps.

Details of proposals will be researched and submitted to Board of directions and BTC for approval in 2015.

However, plan for 2014 was not fully implemented due to 2 main reasons:

- Specific study themes have not been selected;
- Budget for this component in TFF was only 5.000 EURO/year which is not adequate. Therefore, there needs to be a reallocation of budget in result 2 (A 03)

2.6 Performance output 4

2.6.1 Progress of indicators

Output 4: Training and experience exchange between central and provincial working groups					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Numbers of workshop/training that TSU organized with participants from ministries, provinces		3			
Numbers of qualified trainees					

2.6.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
Organizing workshop/training for ministries and provinces		x		

2.6.3 Analysis of progress made

- 02 training courses on M&E for officers from TSU and PCUs were organized by international consultants in April and May 2014.

- 01 training course on project management for officers from TSU, PCUs and MPI was organized in October 2014.

- 100% trainees met requirements and were certified by training agencies.

Managerial and technical capacity of project managing officers were enhanced, creating foundations for meeting progress and quality requirements, objectives and expected results of the projects/program.

2.7 Performance output 5

2.7.1 Progress of indicators

Output 5: National and international study in coordination with 3 provinces					
Indicators	Baseline value	Value year N-1	Value year N	Target year N	End Target
Number of domestic and international study tours that TSU has organized.		1			

2.7.2 Progress of main activities

Progress of <u>main</u> activities	Progress:			
	A	B	C	D
Organizing one study tour in Belgium and Netherlands for TSU and PCUs.		x		

2.7.3 Analysis of progress made

Supported by BTC headquarter, TSU managed and organized a study tour in Belgium and Netherlands from 18 – 30/Oct/2014. The delegation was composed by 15 representatives of MPI, MoF, Ha Tinh and Ninh Thuan provinces.

The objective of this study tour is to learn experiences of respective countries on: (i) adapting to Climate change in urban area in terms of flood management, heat islands with a comprehensive approach including strategic investments, water resource urbanization, sustainable drainage system; (ii) integrated water resource management, sustainable urban development and strategic structural planning, all of which are regarded as a strategy to cope with Climate change issues; (iii) green growth and GHG limitation through efficient energy consuming, renew energy and green purchasing (green house, smart designs, etc)

Experiences and lessons collected in the study tour were highly recognized by participants for its usefulness and helpfulness in terms of institution, finance, selection and technical solutions in investment.

2.8 Transversal Themes

2.8.1 Gender

Participation and gender are regarded by all related parties as a common transversal issues in project's activities especially ones with directive impact to community.

2.8.2 Environment

Project's objective is directed to deal with environmental issues. Therefore, environment is always highly considered during selecting project's actions.

2.8.3 Other

2.9 Risk management

Identification of risk or issue			Analysis of risk or issue			Deal with risk or issue			Follow-up of risk or issue	
Risk description	Period of identification	Category	Likelihood	Potential impact	Total	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
Unclear distribution of roles and mandates between coordinators and board of direction of TSU		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	The POM should clarify the mandate and responsibilities of different stakeholders	Consultant+ RR+ HQ	End of May	BTC has selected consultant who already developed the 1st draft of POM. However, it has not been finished in 2014. Expected to be finished in Q1/2015	
The coordination between the TSU and the provincial project activities is lacking		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	Once budget will be available, increase of the presence of the TSU at province level	TSU		From August 2014, TSU has fulfilled conditions to operate its budget. The performance and coordinating role of TSU at provincial level has been promoted.	
Difficult communication with the TSU direction		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	Communication channels to be defined in the POM	consultant	End of June	POM is developing by the consultants. However, communication channels between TSU and related parties was established and has been being developed in 2014.	
Different interpretation of project modalities Co-management versus NEX		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk	clarification expected through the POM	Consultants+ HQ	End of June	POM has been developing by the consultants but this does not impact seriously the project implementation.	

Slow development of the TSU procurement plan		OPS	Medium	Medium	Medium Risk		TSU	early April	Procurement plan was approved in June 2014. Almost bidding packages have been conducted on schedule and finished in 2014. PCU's related consulting packages had to be moved to 2015 to synchronize with provincial activities	

3 Steering and Learning

3.1 Strategic re-orientations

In 2014, the Program (including 4 component projects) was in inception phase and formulating conditions for next study phase. Therefore, strategic revision/amendment was not set out for the project/program.

3.2 Recommendations

No recommendations

3.3 Lessons Learned

Lessons learned	Target audience
Consensus on objective and cooperation/supporting relationships within the program/project is necessary	TSU, PCUs
Promoting timely communication between related parties: BTC, TSU and PCUs through transferring periodic reports, feedbacks on management information, coordination between agencies.	BTC, TSU, PCUs
TSU's comprehensive supporting to provincial activities with high quality.	TSU
Enhance project's management and implementation capacity	PCUs
BTC should assure approving progress for bidding, especially with provinces' activities.	BTC

4 Annexes

4.1 Quality criteria

1. RELEVANCE: The degree to which the intervention is in line with local and national policies and priorities as well as with the expectations of the beneficiaries					
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>					
Assessment RELEVANCE: total score		A	B	C	D
		X			
1.1 What is the present level of relevance of the intervention?					
X	A	Clearly still embedded in national policies and Belgian strategy, responds to aid effectiveness commitments, highly relevant to needs of target group.			
	B	Still fits well in national policies and Belgian strategy (without always being explicit), reasonably compatible with aid effectiveness commitments, relevant to target group's needs.			
	C	Some issues regarding consistency with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid effectiveness or relevance.			
	D	Contradictions with national policies and Belgian strategy, aid efficiency commitments; relevance to needs is questionable. Major adaptations needed.			
1.2 As presently designed, is the intervention logic still holding true?					
	A	Clear and well-structured intervention logic; feasible and consistent vertical logic of objectives; adequate indicators; Risks and Assumptions clearly identified and managed; exit strategy in place (if applicable).			
X	B	Adequate intervention logic although it might need some improvements regarding hierarchy of objectives, indicators, Risk and Assumptions.			
	C	Problems with intervention logic may affect performance of intervention and capacity to monitor and evaluate progress; improvements necessary.			
	D	Intervention logic is faulty and requires major revision for the intervention to have a chance of success.			

2. EFFICIENCY OF IMPLEMENTATION TO DATE: Degree to which the resources of the intervention (funds, expertise, time, etc.) have been converted into results in an economical way					
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least two 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B', no 'C' or 'D' = B; at least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>					
Assessment EFFICIENCY : total score		A	B	C	D
			X		
2.1 How well are inputs (financial, HR, goods & equipment) managed?					
	A	All inputs are available on time and within budget.			
X	B	Most inputs are available in reasonable time and do not require substantial budget adjustments. However there is room for improvement.			
	C	Availability and usage of inputs face problems, which need to be addressed; otherwise results may be at risk.			
	D	Availability and management of inputs have serious deficiencies, which threaten the achievement of results. Substantial change is needed.			

2.2 How well is the implementation of activities managed?		
	A	Activities implemented on schedule
X	B	Most activities are on schedule. Delays exist, but do not harm the delivery of outputs
	C	Activities are delayed. Corrections are necessary to deliver without too much delay.
	D	Serious delay. Outputs will not be delivered unless major changes in planning.
2.3 How well are outputs achieved?		
	A	All outputs have been and most likely will be delivered as scheduled with good quality contributing to outcomes as planned.
X	B	Output delivery is and will most likely be according to plan, but there is room for improvement in terms of quality, coverage and timing.
	C	Some output are/will be not delivered on time or with good quality. Adjustments are necessary.
	D	Quality and delivery of outputs has and most likely will have serious deficiencies. Major adjustments are needed to ensure that at least the key outputs are delivered on time.

3. EFFECTIVENESS TO DATE: Degree to which the outcome (Specific Objective) is achieved as planned at the end of year N				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: 'At least one 'A', no 'C' or 'D' = A; Two times 'B' = B; At least one 'C', no 'D' = C; at least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment EFFECTIVENESS : total score	A	B	C	D
		X		
3.1 As presently implemented what is the likelihood of the outcome to be achieved?				
	A	Full achievement of the outcome is likely in terms of quality and coverage. Negative effects (if any) have been mitigated.		
X	B	Outcome will be achieved with minor limitations; negative effects (if any) have not caused much harm.		
	C	Outcome will be achieved only partially among others because of negative effects to which management was not able to fully adapt. Corrective measures have to be taken to improve ability to achieve outcome.		
	D	The intervention will not achieve its outcome unless major, fundamental measures are taken.		
3.2 Are activities and outputs adapted (when needed), in order to achieve the outcome?				
	A	The intervention is successful in adapting its strategies / activities and outputs to changing external conditions in order to achieve the outcome. Risks and assumptions are managed in a proactive manner.		
X	B	The intervention is relatively successful in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in order to achieve its outcome. Risks management is rather passive.		
	C	The intervention has not entirely succeeded in adapting its strategies to changing external conditions in a timely or adequate manner. Risk management has been rather static. An important change in strategies is necessary in order to ensure the intervention can achieve its outcome.		
	D	The intervention has failed to respond to changing external conditions, risks were insufficiently managed. Major changes are needed to attain the outcome.		

4. POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY: The degree of likelihood to maintain and reproduce the benefits of an intervention in the long run (beyond the implementation period of the intervention).				
<i>In order to calculate the total score for this quality criterion, proceed as follows: At least 3 'A's, no 'C' or 'D' = A ; Maximum two 'C's, no 'D' = B; At least three 'C's, no 'D' = C ; At least one 'D' = D</i>				
Assessment POTENTIAL SUSTAINABILITY : total score	A	B	C	D
		X		
4.1 Financial/economic viability?				
	A	Financial/economic sustainability is potentially very good: costs for services and maintenance are covered or affordable; external factors will not change that.		
X	B	Financial/economic sustainability is likely to be good, but problems might arise namely from changing external economic factors.		
	C	Problems need to be addressed regarding financial sustainability either in terms of institutional or target groups costs or changing economic context.		
	D	Financial/economic sustainability is very questionable unless major changes are made.		
4.2 What is the level of ownership of the intervention by target groups and will it continue after the end of external support?				
	A	The steering committee and other relevant local structures are strongly involved in all stages of implementation and are committed to continue producing and using results.		
X	B	Implementation is based in a good part on the steering committee and other relevant local structures, which are also somewhat involved in decision-making. Likelihood of sustainability is good, but there is room for improvement.		
	C	The intervention uses mainly ad-hoc arrangements and the steering committee and other relevant local structures to ensure sustainability. Continued results are not guaranteed. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	The intervention depends completely on ad-hoc structures with no prospect of sustainability. Fundamental changes are needed to enable sustainability.		
4.3 What is the level of policy support provided and the degree of interaction between intervention and policy level?				
	A	Policy and institutions have been highly supportive of intervention and will continue to be so.		
X	B	Policy and policy enforcing institutions have been generally supportive, or at least have not hindered the intervention, and are likely to continue to be so.		
	C	Intervention sustainability is limited due to lack of policy support. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	Policies have been and likely will be in contradiction with the intervention. Fundamental changes needed to make intervention sustainable.		
4.4 How well is the intervention contributing to institutional and management capacity?				
	A	Intervention is embedded in institutional structures and has contributed to improve the institutional and management capacity (even if this is not an explicit goal).		
X	B	Intervention management is well embedded in institutional structures and has somewhat contributed to capacity building. Additional expertise might be required. Improvements in order to guarantee sustainability are possible.		
	C	Intervention relies too much on ad-hoc structures instead of institutions; capacity building has not been sufficient to fully ensure sustainability. Corrective measures are needed.		
	D	Intervention is relying on ad hoc and capacity transfer to existing institutions, which could guarantee sustainability, is unlikely unless fundamental changes are undertaken.		

4.2 Decisions taken by the steering committee and follow-up

Decision					Action			Follow-up	
Decision	Identification period (mmm.yy)	Timing	Source*	Actor	Action(s)	Resp.	Deadline	Progress	Status
The allocation of the VN contribution is the responsibility of the project owner (DSENRE/MPI)				DSENRE				MPI has issued the Decision on the counterpart fund allocated in 2014 for the TSU in May 2014 but not equal to commitment	
					Done				
The Approval of TSU FIN & OPS Plan 2014 year				TSU				The approval of FIN and OPS Plan has approved by BTC and MPI in Apr. and May , 2014	
					Done				

The Approval of the TSU Procurement Plan 2014 year				DSENRE			The approval of the procurement plan has approved by BTC and MPI in May and June , 2014	
Submission by MPI to BTC no objection of the procurement bidding documents				DSENRE			BTC has issued NOL for bidding packages in 2014. Bidding has been already finished.	
The replacement of the foreseen national technical assistants by national consultants. They will be contracted for the entire project duration for regular short inputs based on program need (framework contract)				TSU	2 NTA shall be recruited: (i) Communication & community involvement; (ii)CC & hydraulic modelling for quality assurance		NTA recruitment process has been conducted in November 2014. Candidates are being screened. Consultants can start working from March 2015.	

02 National technical assistants on CC and IWRM will still be recruited under fulltime basis contract			SC Minutes	TSU			Vacancy announcements have been published on VietnamNews from October 8-10, 2014 for these two positions . Chosen candidates requested to work part-time. At its meeting on December 12, 2014, the SC has allowed these two experts to work part-time. Therefore, recruitment must be re-done to follow bidding procedures.	
					<i>on-going</i>			
At the meeting on December 12, 2014, The SC assigned the Cashier to work also as Administrative assistance			SC Minutes	TSU			The SC has approved at its meeting on December 12, 2014. New TOR for this position was prepared and requested for BTC's NOL.	
					<i>on-going</i>			
Reallocate 25.000 EURO from budget line A 03 03 02 to A 03 03 03 to organize 01 study tour abroad in 2015.			SC Minutes	TSU			The SC has approved at its meeting on December 12, 2014	
					<i>Done</i>			
Reallocate 1.429 EURO from Z 02 04 to Z 02 01 to pay for car purchasement.			SC Minutes	TSU			BTC Headquarter has approved	
					<i>Done</i>			

4.3 Updated Logical framework

There is no new update until December 31, 2014

4.4 MoRe Results at a glance

Logical framework's results or indicators modified in last 12 months?	Main results: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Finishing 09 TORs for fundamental studies at 3 provinces (3 TORs/province) - Organizing 03 trainings for projects within this program - Organizing 01 study tour in Belgium and Netherlands
Baseline Report registered on PIT?	Not yet
Planning MTR (registration of report)	BTC has not set
Planning ETR (registration of report)	BTC has not set
Backstopping missions since 01/01/2012	None

4.5 “Budget versus current (2014-12)” Report

	Budget		2013		2014		Balance	
	BEL	VN	BEL	VN	BEL	VN	BEL	VN

A0101	180,000.00	172,800.00		12,055.19	21,738.85		158,261.15	160,744.81
A0101					(38.74)		38.74	-
A0102	1,530,000.00		90,123.09		189,249.25		1,250,627.66	-
A0103	750,000.00		-		32,114.46		717,885.54	-
A0104	430,000.00		-		168.00		429,832.00	-
A0105	20,000.00		4,470.67		7,021.54		8,507.79	-
A0201	147,000.00				5,723.41		141,276.59	-
A0301	30,000.00				-		30,000.00	-
A0302	15,000.00				-		15,000.00	-
A0303	200,000.00	227,200.00			47,160.56		152,839.44	227,200.00
A0304	50,000.00				352.97		49,647.03	-
A0401	50,000.00				86.51		49,913.49	-
A0402	50,000.00				-		50,000.00	-
X0101	34,900.00				-		34,900.00	-

X0102	80,000.00				-		80,000.00	-
Z0101	1,500.00				11.78		1,488.22	-
Z0201	24,429.00				24,429.00		-	-
Z0202	6,600.00				3,909.39		2,690.61	-
Z0203	15,800.00				14,859.16		940.84	-
Z0204	148,571.00				16,208.07		132,362.93	-
Z0301	21,600.00				375.85		21,224.15	-
Z0302	36,000.00				10,664.78		25,335.22	-
Z0303	18,000.00				988.12		17,011.88	-
Z0304	57,600.00				3,286.67		54,313.33	-
Z0305					492.78		(492.78)	-
Z0306	18,000.00						18,000.00	-
Z0401	35,000.00						35,000.00	-
Z0402	50,000.00						50,000.00	-

Total	4,000,000.00	400,000.00	94,593.76	12,055.19	378,802.41	-	3,526,603.83	387,944.81
--------------	---------------------	-------------------	------------------	------------------	-------------------	----------	---------------------	-------------------

4.6 Communication resources

Communication experts recruitment and activities have not been conducted. Communication campaigns shall be started in the beginning of 2015.